PROBLEMS IN PHILOSOPHY SEMINAR: MINORITY DISPARITIES IN HEALTHCARE ETHICS

LOGISTICS

Instructor: Glenn “boomer” Trujillo
Email: gmtrujillo@utep.edu
Office location & phone: Worrell Hall 306, (915) 747-5180
Office hours: Mon. 12:00-1:00pm, Wed. 3:30-4:30pm
Also available online by appointment
Course date & location: University of Texas at El Paso, Spring 2024
Asynchronous Online

COURSE DESCRIPTION & OBJECTIVES

A course with issues of current interest to contemporary philosophers. Recent topics have included postmodernism, literature and philosophy, technological society, movies and the making of the American mind, the emergence of world philosophy, and medical ethics. Prerequisite: Junior standing.

Health is an important part of life that so many of us strive for, yet it is difficult to define health as a value, and it is even more difficult to achieve it in everyday practice or guide it via policies in our institutions. An increasing number of researchers also show that health does not affect all people equally; race, gender, and class have varying effects. This course surveys these issues, especially where they interact with each other. The course begins by introducing the most prevalent bioethical theory, Beauchamp and Childress’ principlism, which judges bioethics via the principles of respect for autonomy, beneficence, nonmaleficence, and justice. Then the course applies ethical principles and critical thinking tools to research concerning the pharmaceutical industry, public health, technology, and end-of-life issues, especially where race, gender, and class are concerned. There are two goals for this course: (1) learn the four principles of biomedical ethics, and (2) learn to apply them to current and future problems in healthcare.

COURSE MATERIALS

- Computer, stable internet access, internet browser, Microsoft Word, Microsoft Teams (available via UTEP; contact IT)

ASSIGNMENTS AND GRADING

The grade for the course is solely determined by group papers. Group papers have two components: (1) your individual contribution of an abstract for a reading from the module and (2) your group’s paper, which summarizes the conversation your group had with one another. The assignments are pass/fail. You must complete both the abstract and group paper to get pass for the module’s assignment. It must be on time. No component can be missing.

1 We cannot discuss specific grades over email, due to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA). Also, please don’t use Blackboard messenger, as the platform isn’t reliable for quick responses.
The grading scale for the class is as follows:

- **A**: All 5 modules had both a group reflection and your individual contributions
- **B**: Exactly 4 modules had both a group reflection and your individual contributions
- **C**: Exactly 3 modules had both a group reflection and your individual contributions
- **D**: Exactly 2 modules had both a group reflection and your individual contributions
- **F**: Fewer than 2 modules had both your reflection paper and your individual contributions

**GROUP REFLECTIONS.** I will assign groups randomly on the first day of class. Each group is named after an animal (Ants, Bats, Coyotes, Diamondbacks, Eagles, Foxes, Gorillas, and Hammerheads), and each group will have 5 members or fewer. A total of 5 modules are in the schedule. Each has a group reflection. Each group reflection has two components.

**Component 1: Individual contribution:** Coordinate with your group to make sure that each of you take a different reading. Each person in the group needs to write a 100-word summary of one of the readings (this can come from “Core Readings” or the “Case Studies” section of each module). Additionally (and not counted in the 100-word summary), there needs to be a single verbatim quote from the source that best captures the author’s thesis or main idea. Give page numbers for the quote. Your individual contributions/summaries/abstracts/quotes need to be copied and pasted in the same document as the reflection. *My video lectures do not count for this.* You must use the readings from the module.

**Component 2: Group Reflection:** For each reflection, the goal is simple: meet to discuss the issues in the module’s readings, AND produce a 250–500-word summary (hard limit) of the conversation you have with your group mates. Email it to me by the deadline, and include all your group members in the email recipients. (I send feedback and want everyone to be included. Including everyone means that I can “reply all” to share.) .doc, .docx, .rtf, or .pdf formats only. You also need to email me a screenshot of your group’s group chat (I don’t need a transcript, just proof that you met via Teams, GroupMe, Blackboard, whatever). That means you need to meet *before the deadline of the reflection* to talk and collaborate to produce the paper on time. I know schedules are difficult to coordinate, but we only have seven weeks.

The paper should be more than just notes. It can have multiple viewpoints (e.g., Ines and DaVontay argued x. But Kelly and Ami argued y. Everyone else was in the middle.). But you should explain why each side held the position, and you must reference specific passages (including page numbers/citations of relevant sources). Sometimes the prompts have multiple questions, which are designed to work together. Answer as many as relevant to your group’s focus. But you do not have to answer all questions.

The group portion of the group reflections must have all of the following, or it will result in a fail of the group paper:

- There is screenshot of the group chat attached.
- The summary is 250–500 words.
- The group puts forward a coherent thesis, i.e. the group argues one thing as their answer(s) to the question(s).
- There is at least some evidence (including citations or quotes of passages AND page numbers) that shows the group justified their answer with course material. This is not merely your opinion. This is your opinion informed by course material.

You will have to be organized and complete the readings for the module before your group meeting. But the group meeting might also help you clarify the module’s ideas. The major challenge here will be brevity. Writing one page is tough when you have so many ideas. So, I recommend collaborating to make sure the single page represents what you can agree to. Naturally, one page will not cover every idea that your conversation does. That’s why it’s a *summary* and not a transcript. This is an exercise in writing briefs and memos, something many of you will have to do in many jobs.

In summary, in the email to me and all your group members, each submission needs:

1. In the “To”, address the email to gmtrujillo@utep.edu AND each of your group members
2. Screenshot of proof of your group’s meeting or collaboration
3. 200–300-word summary of your group’s conversation that answers the module’s question (including references)
4. Each group member’s abstract and quote pasted after the group reflection
MAKUPS & BONUS

We only have seven weeks, and the schedule is fast. So, there are no makeups, no late work, and no bonuses. Any schedule conflict means that you need to coordinate with your group to get them your individual contribution and your take on the reflection questions ahead of time. You may always turn things in early.

SCHEDULE

Everything is subject to change, so please keep up with the course Blackboard. If anything changes, I’ll try to give a week’s notice.

MODULE 1: INTRODUCTION TO MEDICAL ETHICS

Introduces the four principles of biomedical ethics as characterized by Beauchamp and Childress. Uses Chinese bioethics to test whether the principles seem universal. Uses the case of Memorial Hospital during Hurricane Katrina to test whether the principles seem usable in non-ideal situations.

Deadlines
Post your individual abstract (including a quote) in Blackboard by Thursday, March 21, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)
Send your group paper (including all components) to me via email by Sunday, March 24, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

Core Readings

Case Study

Group Reflection
Choose two of the four principles of biomedical ethics. Define each. Then explain how each relates to specific aspects of what happened at Memorial Hospital after Hurricane Katrina hit. Do you think philosophers have anything useful to say here, or that they can do anything useful? Who else should be making these decisions or offering ethical analyses?

For Further Reading
· Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, Principles of Biomedical Ethics, 8th Ed. (Oxford, 2019).
· Sheri Fink, Five Days at Memorial: Life and Death in a Storm-Ravaged Hospital (Crown, 2013).

MODULE 2: PHARMACY, PROFIT, AND SALES

Addresses the influence of for-profit pharmaceutical companies on the medical profession and the ways they exploit it. Considers how biotechnologies such as pharmaceuticals interact with moral and social values. Raises questions about healthcare professionals using social media as influencers.

Deadlines
Post your individual abstract (including a quote) in Blackboard by Thursday, March 28, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)
Send your group paper (including all components) to me via email by Sunday, March 31, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

Core Readings
· Carl Elliott, White Coat, Black Hat: Adventures on the Dark Side of Medicine, esp. Intro., Chs. 1, 3, 4.
· Brain D. Earp, Olga A. Wudarczyk, Anders Sandberg, and Julian Savulescu, “If I Could Just Stop Loving You: Anti-Love Biotechnology and the Ethics of a Chemical


**Case Studies**


**Group Reflection**

Pick one of the cases from the articles by Gupta or Earp et alia. Relate it to the material in Elliot’s *White Coat* to talk about the main problem you predict for the future of love in the face of love drugs. Basically, isolate one ethical problem you see with anti-love drugs, especially with respect to the pharmaceutical industry. You’re just trying to diagnose the ethical problem in some detail. You do not need to propose a solution, but you may if you like. It would be extra impressive if you considered the role of social media used by patients/clients and medical professionals.

**For Further Reading**


---

**Deadlines**

Post your individual abstract (including a quote) in Blackboard by Thursday, April 11, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

Send your group paper (including all components) to me via email by Sunday, April 14, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

**Core Readings**


**Case Studies**


---

**MODULE 3: PUBLIC HEALTH AND RACE**

Explores the ways public policy and institutions affect healthcare outcomes, examining especially the role of race in healthcare and public health. Uses the cases of feel-good charities to raise the question of how we do and should make decisions about public health.
Group Reflection
Find US maps that show by state: life expectancy, educational attainment, and GDP. Find US maps that show voting tendencies, Republican versus Democrat. The United States has the most powerful economy in the world. Yet it also has the worst health outcomes per dollar spent, and it is the only powerful economic country not to provide some universal level of public healthcare to its citizens (not including EMTALA and emergency medicine, which is highly inefficient). Moreover, US citizens can go bankrupt from medical bills. In your group’s opinion, what is the main reason that Americans (or Texans) have poor public health? How should our public institutions help with health (especially schools, hospitals, and universities)?

For Further Reading
- David Berardinelli, From Good Hands to Boxing Gloves: the Dark Side of Insurance (Trial Guides, 2008).
- Tracy Kidder, Rough Sleepers: Dr. Jim O’Connell’s Urgent Mission to Bring Healing to Homeless People (Random House, 2023).
- Norman Daniels, Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly (Cambridge: Cambridge, 2008).

Deadlines
Post your individual abstract (including a quote) in Blackboard by Thursday, April 25, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)
Send your group paper (including all components) to me via email by Sunday, April 28, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

Core Readings
- Harriet A. Washington, Medical Apartheid: The Dark History of Medical Experimentation on Black Americans from Colonial Times to Present (New York: Anchor, 2008), epilogue only.

Case Studies

Group Reflection
Why do you think the history of racism and sexism in medicine isn’t taught more frequently (including in high school)? What do you think healthcare professionals and institutions can do to prevent future atrocities? Which problem concerning public health do you think will be the biggest challenge in the future?
For Further Reading


MODULE 5: DEATH & END OF LIFE

Surveys work that asks what it means to face death well. Uses cases surrounding physician-assisted death and medical practitioners facing death.

Deadlines

Post your individual abstract (including a quote) in Blackboard by Thursday, May 2, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)
Send your group paper (including all components) to me via email by Monday, May 6, 11:59pm (El Paso Time)

Core Readings


Case Studies

- Caitlin Doughty, *From Here to Eternity: Traveling the World to Find the Good Death*, esp. Introduction, Epilogue.

https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2018/02/05/what-does-it-mean-to-die.

Group Reflection

What do you think is the best way to remember the dead? If you could propose a universal death ceremony, what would it be like? Why? Scientists develop a way to make you ‘immortal.’ Whenever you take the treatment, physical aging stops, and your mind will stay sharp. You will only die in case of tragedy or suicide. Everyone has access to this for free. Do you decide to take it? Why/not?

For Further Reading


Syllabus prepared by G. M. Trujillo, Jr. on 22 January 2024
COURSE POLICIES AND PRACTICES

CAVEAT PHILOSOPHUS

Philosophy’s hard. For everyone. The best students approach the subject with humility, curiosity, and a willingness to mess up. Insight has notoriously bad manners, coming when it pleases and resisting eloquent expression. I’ll make mistakes discussing arguments, and you will too. The classroom is a lab for testing ideas, not a museum for pristine dogma. That’s why we must be open-minded, civil, and cooperative in class. Respect each other’s names, pronouns, and stances. And please do not advocate for the Devil, as he has adequate representation. I will not tolerate rudeness. We’re here to become better thinkers. Sure, we’ll construct and critique, explore and squabble. But never without realizing we’re in this together. Be human in discussion. When you’re unsure of whether you should say something, ask: Does it need to be said? By me? Right now? If no to any of those questions, maybe hold off and talk with me after class.

If the classroom environment is counter-productive in any way, you may always talk with me before or after class, send me an e-mail, or slip an anonymous note under my office door. I will do my best to foster a constructive environment. We’re in this discussion together, and I learn a lot from my students. So, if you feel I’ve crossed the line, ignored an important perspective, or plain gotten something wrong, you may always confront me.

PARTICIPATION AND STUDENT SUCCESS

To take something from philosophy, you need to engage the ideas. That means reading the assignments with care and attention, as well as showing up to class with questions or comments about specific problems in the texts. Attentive readers often ask:

1. What’s the author’s thesis/main idea in the reading?
2. What is one argument that the author makes? Is it elegant or intricate, generalizable or reductive?
3. Is the conclusion of the argument true or false? Does the support offered connect strongly or weakly?
4. Which idea in the paper is the clearest/best/strongest? Why?
5. Which idea in the paper is the least clear/worst/weakest? How could the author improve it?
6. What’s the author’s main point on page X, paragraph Y? Why is it compelling/repulsive?
7. How does this work compare with others? Is the debate missing a perspective or idea?
8. Is there a word or phrase that seems important to the author that isn’t clear?

Come up with a system to annotate your books. Put stars next to passages that you love. Put Xs next to passages that you hate. Put ?s next to passages or words you don’t understand. Underline or highlight important ideas. Put a couple words out to the side to say what a page or paragraph addresses. The more you can do to be active while reading, the better.

For participation, you don’t have to be an extrovert. If you don’t like talking, chat with me in office hours, or share a passage from the text that struck you and ask the class what they think. Also note, just because you speak in class doesn’t mean it’s participation. Quality matters.

ASKING BETTER QUESTIONS

“Isn’t it all just subjective/relative?” and “Doesn’t this come down to semantics?” are questions that are usually unhelpful. Dig deeper. Try to figure out what evidence makes something subjective/relative, or which disagreement or equivocation makes something seem a mere semantic dispute. We can start with these questions, but we almost always need to go beyond them. As a general trick: get specific. Questions almost always start broad, but as you gain knowledge, they focus. Ask whatever. But when you think through issues on your own time, spend a few moments really feeling what bothers or intrigues you.

ACCOMMODATIONS

The University is committed to providing reasonable accommodations and auxiliary services to students, staff, faculty, job applicants, applicants for admissions, and other beneficiaries of University programs, services and activities with documented disabilities in order to provide them with equal opportunities to participate in programs, services, and activities in compliance with sections 503 and 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, as amended, and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990 and the Americans with Disabilities Act Amendments Act (ADAAA) of 2008. Students who become pregnant or have parenting responsibilities may also request reasonable accommodations. Reasonable accommodations will be made unless it is determined that doing so would cause undue hardship on the University. The UTEP Center for Accommodations and Support Services (CASS) will process requests for accommodations based on a disability, pregnancy, or parenting. Contact the Center for Accommodations and Support Services at 915-747-5148, email them at cass@utep.edu, or apply for accommodations online via the CASS portal.

ACADEMIC DISHONESTY

Academic dishonesty is prohibited and is considered a violation of the UTEP Handbook of Operating Procedures. It includes, but is not limited to, cheating, plagiarism, and collusion. Use of ChatGPT or other AI software for writing is prohibited. Cheating may involve copying from or providing information to another student, possessing unauthorized materials during a test, or falsifying research data on laboratory reports. Plagiarism occurs when someone intentionally or knowingly represents the words or ideas of another as one’s own. Collusion involves collaborating with another person to commit any academically dishonest act. Any act of academic dishonesty attempted by a UTEP student is unacceptable and will not be tolerated. All suspected violations of academic integrity at The University of Texas at El Paso must be reported to the Office of Student Conduct and Conflict Resolution (OSCCR) for possible disciplinary action. Please visit HOOP: Student Conduct and Discipline.

CLASS RECORDING

Recording of class meetings in video or audio is prohibited. Doing so may result in disciplinary action.
COPYRIGHT STATEMENT
All materials used in this course are protected by copyright law. The course materials are only for the use of students currently enrolled in this course and only for the purpose of this course. They may not be further disseminated.

MAKE-UP WORK
Make-up work will be given only in the case of a documented emergency from the Dean of Students Office. Note that make-up work may be in a different format than the original work, may require more intensive preparation, and may be graded with penalty points. If you miss an assignment and the reason is not considered excusable, you will receive a zero. It is therefore important to reach out to the instructor (in advance if at all possible) to explain with proper documentation why you missed a given course requirement. Once a deadline has been established for make-up work, no further extensions or exceptions will be granted.

DROP POLICY
According to UTEP Curriculum and Classroom Policies:
"When, in the judgment of the instructor, a student has been absent to such a degree as to impair his or her status relative to credit for the course, the instructor may drop the student from the class with a grade of “W” before the course drop deadline and with a grade of “F” after the course drop deadline." See academic regulations in the UTEP Undergraduate Catalog for a list of excused absences. If you feel you are unable to complete the course successfully, notify the instructor and contact the Registrar’s Office to initiate the drop process. If you do not, you are at risk of receiving an “F” for the course.

INCOMPLETE GRADES
Incomplete grades may be requested only in exceptional circumstances after you have completed at least half of the course requirements. Talk to me immediately if you believe an incomplete is warranted. If granted, we will establish a contract of work to be completed with deadlines.

TITLE IX & MANDATORY REPORTING
Sexual misconduct (including sexual harassment, sexual assault, and any other nonconsensual behavior of a sexual nature) and sex discrimination violate University policies. Students experiencing such behavior may obtain support from the Counseling and Psychological Services [(915) 747-5302] and Student Health and Wellness Center [(915) 747-5624]. Title IX violations should be reported. For more information, contact the Dean of Students Office [(915) 747-5648], the Title IX Office [(915) 747-8358], or UTEP Police Department [(915) 747-5611].

Disclosure to University faculty or instructors of sexual misconduct, domestic violence, dating violence, or sex discrimination occurring on campus, in a University-sponsored program, or involving a campus visitor or University student or employee (whether current or former) is not confidential under Title IX. Faculty and instructors must forward such reports, including names and circumstances, to the University’s Title IX officer.

COVID-19 ACCOMODATIONS
Students are not permitted on campus when they have a positive COVID-19 test, exposure or symptoms. If you are not permitted on campus, you should contact me as soon as possible so we can arrange necessary and appropriate accommodations. Students who are considered high risk according to CDC guidelines and/or those who live with individuals who are considered high risk may contact Center for Accommodations and Support Services (CASS) to discuss temporary accommodations.

COVID-19 PRECAUTIONS
You must STAY AT HOME and REPORT if you (1) have been diagnosed with COVID-19, (2) are experiencing COVID-19 symptoms, or (3) have had recent contact with a person who has received a positive coronavirus test. Reports should be made at screening.utep.edu. If you know of anyone who should report any of these three criteria, you should encourage them to report. If the individual cannot report, you can report on their behalf by sending an email to COVIDAction@utep.edu. Under no circumstances should anyone come to class when feeling ill or exhibiting any of the known COVID-19 symptoms. Students are advised to minimize the number of encounters with others to avoid infection.

You must wear a face covering over your nose and mouth at all times in this class. If you choose not to wear a face covering, you may not enter the classroom. If you remove your face covering, you will be asked to put it on or leave the classroom. Students who refuse to wear a face covering and follow preventive COVID-19 guidelines will be dismissed from the class and will be subject to disciplinary action according to Section 1.2.3 Health and Safety and Section 1.2.2.5 Disruptions in the UTEP Handbook of Operating Procedures. Please note that if COVID-19 conditions deteriorate in the City of El Paso, all course and lab activities may be transitioned to remote delivery.
COURSE OBJECTIVES

But by the end of the course, successful students will be able to:

- Follow instructions.
- Ask questions about a philosophical piece’s word choice, argumentative structure, or overall purpose.
- Identify theses of philosophical arguments and evaluate the argument’s evidence.
- Use the principle of charity to address enthymemes.
- Define key philosophical words and phrases.
- Express positions on issues lucidly and succinctly, considering relevant complexities and counterguardians.

Every day, students will read, evaluate, and synthesize texts from primary and secondary materials in preparation for class, and participation activities will allow students to practice these skills while the instructor offers feedback. The very nature of these issues requires that students learn to analyze the relationship between (a) sociocultural factors in their historical contexts, (b) the intellectual work that inquiry takes, and (c) the creativity expression that certain problems necessitate. The readings and units are designed to get students to see issues from multiple points of view—historical, social, cultural, and philosophical. And through participation activities, writing reflections, and exams, students will learn to communicate effectively in both speech and writing, especially by making arguments that interpret the texts and offer evidence for the view expressed.

UTEP RESOURCES

UNIVERSITY WRITING CENTER (UWC) (Library, Main Floor, uwctutors@utep.edu, (915) 747-5112, utep.edu/uwc/): Submit papers here for assistance with writing style and formatting, ask a tutor for help and explore other writing resources.

HISTORY TUTORING CENTER (HTC) (Liberal Arts Building, Rm. 320, history@utep.edu, (915) 747-5508): Receive assistance with writing history papers, get help from a tutor and explore other history resources.

Individual Resources

MILITARY STUDENT SUCCESS CENTER (Mike Loya Academic Services Bldg., Rm. 130, mssc@utep.edu, (915) 747-5342, utep.edu/student-affairs/mssc/): Assists personnel in any branch of service to reach their educational goals.

CENTER FOR ACCOMMODATIONS AND SUPPORT SERVICES (Union East, Rm. 106, cass@utep.edu, (915) 747-5148, utep.edu/student-affairs/cass/): Assists students with ADA-related accommodations for coursework, housing, and internships.

COUNSELING AND PSYCHOLOGICAL SERVICES (Union West, Rm. 202, caps@utep.edu, (915) 747-5302, utep.edu/student-affairs/counsel/): Provides a variety of counseling services including individual, couples, and group sessions as well as career and disability assessments.

STUDENT HEALTH AND WELLNESS CENTER (Union East, Ste. 100, studenthealth@utep.edu, (915) 747-5624, utep.edu/chs/shc/): Addresses health care needs of all UTEP students.

DEAN OF STUDENTS OFFICE (Union West, Rm. 102, DOS@utep.edu, (915) 747-5648, utep.edu/student-affairs/dean-of-students-office/): Creates a culture of care for students by providing exemplary programs and services designed to enhance success.

DIVISION OF STUDENT AFFAIRS (Union East, Rm. 301, studentaffairs@utep.edu, (915) 747-5076, utep.edu/student-affairs/): Supports student success inside and outside the classroom.

UTEP RESOURCES

Technology and Academic Resources

HELP DESK (Library, Rm. 300, helpdesk@utep.edu, (915) 747-4357 (HELP), utep.edu/technologysupport/): Students experiencing technological challenges (email, Blackboard, software) can submit a work ticket to the UTEP Helpdesk for help. Contact the Helpdesk via phone, email, chat, website, or in person if on campus.

UTEP LIBRARY (ask@utep.libanswers.com, (915) 747-5643, utep.edu/library/): Access a wide range of resources, including online, full-text access to thousands of journals and ebooks plus reference service and librarian assistance for enrolled students.

OFFICE OF STUDENT FELLOWSHIPS AND AWARDS (utep.edu/student-affairs/student-fellowships-awards/index.html)

TITLE IX OFFICE (Kelly Hall, Rm. 312, TitleIX@utep.edu, (915) 747-8358, utep.edu/titleix/): Protects students, employees, applicants for admission and employment, and other persons from all forms of sex discrimination including sexual misconduct, sexual harassment, and acts of sexual violence.

UTEP POLICE DEPARTMENT (4118 Sun Bowl Drive, next to Facility Services, police@utep.edu, (915) 747-5611)

SUBMIT A REPORT (utep.edu/student-affairs/osccr/report/): Online forms for reportable offenses at UTEP.